The Representation of Afghan Refugees in Pakistani Print Media

Name: Khadija Khan

Roll no.: 241605327

SOCL 499: Final Year Independent Research Project 2024

Thesis Supervisor: Dr. Sara Rizvi Jafree

Department of Sociology

Forman Christian College (A Chartered University)

Contents

Abstract

The paper examines the portrayal of Afghan refugees in Pakistani media following the government's October 2023 announcement of a mass exodus of undocumented foreign nationals, primarily impacting Afghan refugees. Utilizing a thematic analysis approach, the study analyzes articles published by *Dawn* between October 3 and November 1, 2023. The paper seeks to uncover the dominant narratives, framing techniques, and labels associated with Afghan refugees, focusing on media reliance on official sources and potential state influence. The findings reveal a tendency towards negative labeling, limited social integration narratives, and an overreliance on government statements. Through the lens of Chomsky's propaganda model and framing theory, the analysis highlights how media representation might reinforce state narratives, impacting public perception and policy making. This study contributes to media studies by providing insights into the implications of biased portrayals for public discourse and refugee integration efforts.

Keywords: *bias and slant, framing, labelling, media narratives and themes*

Acknowledgements

I would like to dedicate my work to my sister, Fatima, may she find peace where she is.

I'd like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Sara, for her immense care and belief in me. I could not have completed this work without her support, as well as the facilities and faculty of the university's Sociology Department. I'd like to especially thank my friends Ighna Danyal and Rabia Javed for standing by my side and making sure I finished my work on time. Their encouragement and belief have always been immeasurably precious to me, and it is thanks to them that I was able to complete this all.

Introduction

A mass exodus of illegal immigrants was announced by the Pakistani government on October 3rd, 2023 (DawnNews, 2023). This announcement was thought to disproportionately affect Afghan refugees in the country, as the majority of foreign nationals in Pakistan consist of Afghans. In the past four decades, Pakistan has become home to approximately 4 million Afghans who fled their country following continued instability and political turmoil that has become part and parcel of the landscape of Afghanistan. Security concerns associated with certain demographics, like women, in Afghanistan, have resulted in a general reluctance to return to their homeland.

Pakistani officials and politicians supported this decision by the government based on security concerns. The announcement was made after attacks and suicide bombings in Pakistan which were blamed upon a militant group thought to have leadership based in Afghanistan and thus the group is made up of primarily Afghan, and Afghan-influenced Pakistanis, who are jihadists and extremists (Dawn, 2023). The group is known by the name Tehreek-e-Taliban. Moreover, according to the ISPR, the army chief received a debriefing about the security situation of the country and had this to say, "Illegal foreigners were seriously affecting Pakistan's security and economy. Decision to repatriate them has been taken by the government in the interest of Pakistan" (Shirazi, 2023).

Around the same time as the proclamation of mass exodus of illegal immigrants, in December of 2023, it was announced by the Caretaker Interior Minister that legal Afghan nations in Pakistan were not allowed to be involved in political activity and would be deported if found to have any part in such activities (Dawn, 2023).

These decisions made by the Pakistani government elicited a diverse range of responses from both the Pakistani media and people. Some people called for the reversal of this decision and others thought that it was high time for such an action plan to be called. As was explored in this paper, the media was mostly in line with the government's stance on the issue.

Pakistani media has covered the topic of Afghan refugees in Pakistan multiple times in the past, especially in the months leading up to the decision of the expulsion. This demographic has been of interest to the news since the 1970s, and for many their opinions about these Afghan citizens were formed by the type of news they heard about them (Batool, 2019). Media creates reality and controls the narrative, and the narrative surrounding the refugees in Pakistan is something that was explored in this paper.

This paper examines, via thematic analysis, the reality and narrative created by the Pakistani media regarding the mass exodus and the Afghan refugees. The message being broadcast as well as the audience of each broadcast is also something which we investigate as well. Moreover, the state's control of the media is examined as well as the goal to be achieved by the state. Finally, any framing is also delved into during this paper. Finally, it is suggested that to create a more inclusive and transparent media industry in Pakistan, regulatory bodies like PEMRA (Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority) should operate independently with public involvement in decision-making processes (Zulfiqar, 2022). Strengthening protections for freedom of expression, adapting policies for digital media, and improving media literacy and ethical training are also crucial reforms.

Research Objectives

The research objectives of this study are as follows:

1.	To identify and categorize the predominant narratives and themes in the Pakistani media's portrayal of Afghan refugees from October 3, 2023, to 1ˢᵗ November 2024.

2.	To evaluate the extent to which the reliance on official sources impacts the angle displayed in news articles concerning Afghan refugees.

3.	To check the overall media coverage of the issue for preconceived biases about Afghan refugees, establishing whether the reporting lens remains positive, neutral or critical.

4.	To provide insight regarding the understanding of media representation of minority groups and focus on implications for public opinion, social integration, and policymaking.

5.	Shed light on potential biases and recurring patterns in current media ethics and emphasize the importance of objective reporting.

Research Questions

The research questions in this study are as follows:

1. What is the slant of the presentation of information in the media?
2. Is there an agenda guiding the media and articles?
3. Are both perspectives to the argument given equal space?
4. What labels are associated with Afghan refugees?

Significance of Study

This research attempted to study and analyze media dynamics to contribute to a deeper understanding of their effect on the broader socio-political climate of the region, especially as complex historical, geopolitical, and humanitarian concerns mark the said region. By studying

how Afghan refugees are represented in Pakistani media, it tried to highlight the role media representation plays in shaping public perception and influencing policy debates. The findings shed light on whether media coverage aligns with state interests, perpetuates stereotypes, or challenges prevailing narratives, offering insights into the degree of independence or bias within Pakistan's media landscape.

Media representations of marginalized groups like Afghan refugees are important for several reasons. It elucidates how narratives in the media can humanize or dehumanize the marginalized groups that are represented. This detrimentally affects the attitudes and empathy people extend towards them, impacting social integration and policy responses.

From a wider perspective, the study adds to the existing literature on the media representation of refugees and minority groups and its significance. It adds to the global discourse of media ethics, freedom of speech, and the importance of social responsibility in the field. This research can help benefit future media practitioners by highlighting potential biases and patterns in media, to foster a more balanced and inclusive reporting, prioritizing fairness and accuracy. This can eventually be morphed into more informed public attitudes, raise media literacy, and promote ethical journalism.

Literature Review

The happenings of our reality are given significance and understood through how they are interpreted by whoever is reporting them. As such, news articles can be said to hold immense power when regarding narrative building and role allocation (Andrew, 2007). Article content is not the only thing to consider when exploring themes and labelling associated with minorities, such as Afghan refugees in Pakistan, in society, headlines are also important to analyze. Public attitudes and behaviours are often affected by mass media, as it is seen as an influential force that also affects various parts of society (Newton, 2006).

It is believed to have the ability to shape political attitudes, influence public opinion, and impact the functioning of state institutions. The media is described as setting the agenda of public discussion, determining what people think and talk about in the realm of politics. It is considered a primary forum for political discourse and information dissemination. While the media is acknowledged for its influence, there are concerns about its potential to distort information and contribute to public ignorance and incomprehension of political issues. The constant flow of news and superficial treatment of events can lead to misunderstandings and misinterpretations. Overall, while the media is recognized for its potential to influence public perceptions and political processes, there is also an emphasis placed on the importance of considering various mediating factors that can either amplify or weaken the media's impact. By acknowledging the complexities of media effects and the role of other social forces, a nuanced perspective can be presented on the power of the mass media in modern politics.

The relationship between Pakistan and Afghanistan is influenced by historical, geopolitical, security, and economic factors. Both countries share a long border and have

experienced fluctuations in their relations due to regional geopolitical differences (Jan, Hassan, & Abbasi, 2021). Pakistan has supported Afghanistan against insurgent and terrorist groups, particularly after the 9/11 attacks (Afridi, Yousufi, & Khan, 2014). However, mistrust has been a consistent issue in their relations, exacerbated by the involvement of foreign powers (Anjum, Malik, & Rabbi, 2019). The strategic dynamics in the region, including involvement from global players like China and the US, have influenced the Pakistan-Afghanistan relationship. Pakistan's alignment with the US post-9/11 and its strategic partnership with China has influenced its stance on Afghanistan (Khan, 2020; Naseer, 2021). The evolving security situation in Afghanistan, especially with the Taliban's takeover, has presented non-traditional security challenges for Pakistan (Ahmed, 2022). The Pashtun communities in both countries, due to historical tensions and confrontations, have affected bilateral relations (Boggs, 2012). Pakistan's approach to Afghanistan is coloured by the aim to counter Indian influence in the area. Another factor in its stance on Afghanistan is Pakistan's strategic culture, including its support for groups like the Taliban.

A multifaceted approach is taken when it comes to Pakistan's treatment of Afghan refugees. It is influenced by numerous variables like security concerns, economic effects, and legal issues. The presence of Afghan refugees in Pakistan has been a long-standing issue, with millions residing in the country for several decades (Zubair et al., 2019). A negative economic impact on Pakistan is observed by studies which examine the effect of hosting Afghan refugees in the country (Baloch et al., 2017; Mahmood, 2022). Concerns regarding the health and nutritional status of Afghan refugees in Pakistan have been raised, with research highlighting issues such as malnutrition and mental health disorders among this population (Gerritsen et al.,

2006; Fatima et al., 2023; Saeedullah et al., 2021; Malik et al., 2019). So, their stay in the country is deemed detrimental for all parties by some.

Geopolitical dynamics and domestic security issues have shaped Pakistan's policy towards Afghan refugees. A relatively favourable treatment and environment have traditionally been provided by Pakistan, especially keeping in mind the prolonged conflict in Afghanistan (Mukhtar et al., 2023). Legal viewpoints are also to be considered when discussing Afghan refugees in Pakistan, including the status of refugees under various agreements and Pakistan's constitution (Zubair et al., 2019; Zubair et al., 2019).

The discussion about the framing and portrayal of the issues regarding Afghan refugees in Pakistan, specifically regarding their involuntary repatriation, has been given attention due to media analysis (Jehangir, 2023). When it comes to Afghan refugees, the narratives are usually over themes of livelihood strategies, economic integration, and legal frameworks. As such, displaying a complex relationship between humanitarian, security, economic, and legal considerations (Khan & Anwar, 2021; R., 2011).

Recently, an interest has been developed regarding media representation of Afghan refugees. The impact that media representation can have on general public opinion and policy decisions has been examined and analyzed in studies (Weng & Mansouri, 2021). Thematic analysis has been a useful tool in understanding the nuances of these media representations.

It was found that in the top five Bangladeshi media houses, the Rohingya refugees were referred to with a neutral tone, often calling the refugees "Rohingya" rather than the negative label used by the Myanmar government of "Bengali Settler" (Fatima & Torun, 2022). The atrocities committed by the Myanmar army, the diplomatic efforts to find a solution, and the

repatriation of the Rohingya people were the highlighted themes that emerged from the paper's analysis.

The human-centric aspects of humanitarian crises, like that affecting the Rohingya people, were found not to be the focus of the media coverage done by the Malaysian media. Instead, the media focused on what the influx of refugees would mean politically and judged them for their security implications (Ehmer & Kothari, 2020). Australian media has also found itself the recipient of criticism due to its tendency to portray migrants and refugees, particularly those from Muslim and African backgrounds, as a threat to social cohesion and national security (Weng & Mansouri, 2021).

Public opinion and policymaking are significantly impacted by these media discourses, and the way these vulnerable populations are shown in the media must be critically analyzed.

Theoretical Framework

The base of the theoretical framework for this research was built around Chomsky's propaganda model (Herman & Chomsky, 2006) and Goffman's framing theory (Goffman, 1974). Chomsky's propaganda model focuses on the influence of ownership, reliance on official sources, and the power of controlling ideologies of ownership, (Bennett et al., 1989), providing an effective lens that allows a fair assessment of motivations and biases in media reporting. The model asserted that state-owned and supported media outlets present narratives that follow state and bourgeoise concerns. This framework is vital in pinpointing whether the Pakistani media's illustrative representation of Afghan refugees reinforces state-directed implications.

This is supported by Goffman's framing theory, which serves as an indispensable tool in recognizing how the stories of Afghan refugees are carefully constructed through the emphasis

on certain elements and the removal of others to structure the public outlook. Essentially, framing theory aids in dismantling how information is categorized and presented. For example, when discussing the issue of Afghan refugees in everyday routines, Pakistani media houses focus on particular themes, such as security, economic concerns, crime, etc. or employ specific labels that influence readers' understanding of the issue.

The aforementioned theoretical approaches frame the proposed research question, "How are Afghan refugees represented in Pakistani media, and what factors influence these portrayals?". The application of Chomsky's propaganda model allows the study to investigate whether the use of official sources, ownership structures, and ideological stances contributes to a state-aligned agenda in news reporting. The portrayal of Afghan refugees is made up of many factors, such as language, semantics, and the way information about them is presented. Framing theory is used to examine which elements are emphasized and how that affects the overall portrayal.

The implication of labels used for Afghan refugees, critical vs positive, the repeating themes that lead the narrative surrounding them, e.g. economic impact, security issues, and the extent of reliance on state or official sources within the articles are the study variables. Other variables include bias in the language and the framing of events. These variables are important in understanding the role of media in shaping public opinion.

This study seeks to reveal patterns in the portrayal of Afghan refugees, and this theoretical framework allows the research to link media narratives to broader socio-political structures by grounding its analysis in established models. Furthermore, it can also be seen to which degree state influence permeates media narratives, and thus, the potential societal impacts of such representations can be understood. Through the operationalization of Chomsky's

propaganda model and framing theory, the study provides insights into how Pakistani media might construct or propagate specific narratives regarding the Afghan refugee crisis.

Methodology

Research Design

The methodology for this study involves the thematic analysis of news articles dated between October 3rd, 2023, and November 1st, 2023, which talk about the Afghans in Pakistan. These articles are all published by the news outlet *Dawn.* Moreover, the intent behind the period selected is October 3rd the date that the announcement of the mass exodus first happened and the 1st of November is the deadline given to undocumented foreign nationals to vacate the country.

The thematic analysis focuses on identifying themes such as labels used to describe Afghan refugees (e.g., positive or negative connotations), framing techniques, and overall slant or bias in the articles. This involves careful examination of each article, where sections of significance and relevance are noted, to see whether similar themes occur in other articles mentioning the Afghans. The analysis of these articles allows for a thorough assessment of how media narratives are constructed and whether they reflect state perspectives or broader social biases.

Conceptualization

Media Narratives and Themes

Patterns which emerge due to the reporting style utilized regarding certain topics, in this case, Afghan refugees in Pakistan, is what is meant by media narratives. Understanding themes which may be included in these narratives, such as economic impact, domestic security concerns, humanitarian needs, and social integration challenges etc., helps identify the leading perspectives being conveyed to the general public.

Framing Techniques

How articles place importance on specific aspects, such as victimization, threat, or resilience, and the semantics used to invoke certain emotions or biases is what is meant by framing. It involves the selection of certain elements of an event to shape how an audience interprets the information.

Language and Labels

"Refugees", "displaced persons", "illegal immigrants", and "threats" are examples of some labels which are used to describe Afghan refugees. Labels in general can range from neutral to critical and negative to even positive. Labels significantly shape audience perception and can either humanize, dehumanize, or even demonize the subject group.

State Influence and Official Sources

The extent to which state narratives are reflected or amplified is how state influence in media is conceptualized. This can even be potentially influenced by ownership or reliance on government supporters. The use of official sources within articles indicates whether the media aligns with or challenges the state's perspective.

Bias and Slant

Bias refers to a media outlet's inclination towards a particular stance, which may manifest in subtle or overt ways. Slant involves the overall tone of the article, which can be supportive, neutral, or critical.

Sampling

Data collection involved extracting almost 50 articles by accessing the archive of the

Dawn website and reading the headline and blurb of each article from 3rd October 2023 to 1st

November 2023. Articles which include content about Afghans were collected and analyzed.

Ethics

Ethically, this study has no risks as it utilizes publicly available data and does not involve

human subjects. Thus, formal consent is not required. The research is conducted with a

commitment to impartiality, ensuring that no harm is caused to any individual or group through

the analysis and interpretation of media content. Potential limitations include the challenge of

analyzing a large volume of articles within the set timeline.

Findings

The portrayal of Afghan refugees in media coverage plays a critical role in shaping public perception and influencing policies. This section examines the themes and narratives present in *Dawn* news articles published between October 3, 2023, and November 1, 2023, to explore how Afghan refugees are represented during a period marked by heightened tensions surrounding their forced repatriation. Through an analysis of recurring themes such as the use of negative labels, the absence of stories on social integration, the reliance on government quotations, emphasis on resource strain, and selective reporting, the findings highlight the media's role in reinforcing stereotypes, marginalization, and public bias. These patterns reveal a complex interplay between state narratives, societal attitudes, and media framing that collectively shape the discourse surrounding Afghan refugees in Pakistan.

Negative Labels

In the *Dawn* news articles published on their website, a reoccurring theme seemed to be their repeated use of labels like "illegal" "foreigner" and "aliens" when describing the Afghan refugees, especially in their headlines. These headlines and labels not only dehumanize the Afghan refugees but also portray them as outsiders who do not belong. The consistent use of such terms further contributes to their marginalization and fosters an environment where they are viewed as a problem or threat to the nation. By focusing on terms that emphasize their "illegality" and foreignness, the media reinforces negative stereotypes and deepens societal divisions, preventing meaningful dialogue on their rights and needs as refugees.

Lack of Social Integration

In the period mentioned, 3rd October 2023 to 1st Nov 2023, there is barely any mention of stories or incidents of Afghans being socially integrated within the community. In fact, in some articles there are mentions of members of the community selling out the location of Afghan refugees to the government. While the news gives brief reports on meetings, and demonstrations being held to discuss and protest the exodus of the Afghans, there is an equal emphasis on reports of the people of their communities making them feel othered by giving away their location and identities. Moreover, stories of social inclusion are few and far between.

Reliance on Government Quotations

Almost every article talking about the forced return of the Afghan refugees directly quotes what has been said by government officials. Whether that be figures, or reports of the locations where "illegal foreigners" have been caught. While there are some quotes by international parties, they are far outweighed by government quotations.

The heavy reliance on government quotations in the coverage of Afghan refugees underscores a one-sided narrative that reflects state policies and concerns. While these government statements often highlight security and economic challenges posed by the refugees, they fail to provide a balanced perspective by omitting voices from the refugee community or independent humanitarian organizations. A negative light can be shed on the refugees, which reinforces the idea that they are a burden to the state, due to this selective quoting. The depth of the public's understanding of the crisis is limited by the limited inclusion of alternative viewpoints from international parties. Thus, a narrative is shaped which is mostly led by government interests.

Emphasis on Strained Resources

Scarce resources were given as a factor of the declaration of the exodus, and this sentiment is reinforced by some editorials and government officials' statements. This portrayal emphasizes a narrative which risks using the vulnerable population of Afghan refugees as a scapegoat.

The Afghan refugees are made to be the cause of Pakistan's problems rather than the broader political, historical, and economic factors by citing economic difficulties or lack of resources as the reason for their forced repatriation. Due to this framing, contributions that refugees may make to society are overlooked, not only that but this also misrepresents the complexity of the above-mentioned issues. Policies which prioritize national interests over humanitarian considerations are supported by the media when they focus on the perceived resource strain. Thus, the sense of crisis and urgency in the public's viewpoint is deepened.

Negative Portrayal When Not Victimized

Sports, polio cases, or instances of terrorism are the only other times Afghans were mentioned in the articles examined. It seemed that when not talking about the mass exodus that the Afghans were forced to undertake, they were to be objects of fear and ostracization.

This selective reporting not only perpetuates fear and prejudice but also denies the refugees the opportunity to be viewed as individuals or contributors to society. The tendency to frame Afghan refugees within these specific, often negative, contexts reinforces their portrayal as a population to be feared or pitied, rather than understood or integrated.

Discussion

The aim of this study was to analyze the portrayal of Afghans in Pakistani print media and theorize about the factors affecting their representation. By examining the articles published during the period between 3rd October and 1st November 2023, five themes were identified, the first being the presence of negative labels being used to describe the Afghan refugees in Pakistan, especially in the headlines.

Headlines are extremely important in setting the narrative of an article. Maria Konnikova in her piece about *How Headlines Change the Way We Think* quotes Ullrich Ecker, a cognitive psychologist, and mentions his study to make the point that headlines enable people to already make a conclusion about the article and subject matter they're about to read about even before finishing the article (Konnikova 2014).

Other literature (Shabir, Ali, & Iqbal 2011) supports that even elsewhere in the world, specifically in the US, the media portrays Afghan refugees in a negative light. A study done in Pakistan also supports that the media, when talking about Afghan refugees, takes on more of an accusing, blaming them for being "security risks" and negative tone rather than even a neutral one (Alam, Anwar, & Haq 2022).

The second finding of the study was the lack of an attempt to socially integrate the settled refugees within Pakistani society. In contrast with my findings, a study done after the previous government's decision to grant Pakistani citizenship to Afghan and Bengali refugees found that most print media was in favour of including refugees within their society and granting them the same rights as citizens (Khan, Akbar, Inam 2022). However, most refugees were still not awarded citizenship even after that declaration.

The overreliance on government quotations was the third finding of the study. By mostly giving voice to the government's perspective, which they already have channels to propagate, silences the voices of dissent and gives the impression that society is unanimously agreeing to whatever the government is deciding upon, leading to a lack of criticism and growth. While the articles certainly mentioned these voices of dissent, equal weightage was not given to them. Moreover, the fourth finding, which is the strain on local resources, also coincides with the third finding as the government is giving voice to that sentiment. Pipa Norris in her paper argues that a free press which represents every angle, and all voices is what leads to good governance (Norris P, 2006).

The last finding of the study has to do with the overall negative press that the Afghans get in Pakistan. When not being portrayed as victims to be pitied they were only mentioned in a negative light. A study examining the media representation of Afghans in Pakistan after the APS attack concluded that the perception of this demographic became increasingly negative in the media (Batool S, 2019).

Conclusion

The portrayal of Afghan refugees in Pakistani print media reflects complex narratives influenced by multiple socio-political factors. The narratives observed in this study include five main themes, which indicated a predominantly negative depiction of Afghans in Pakistan. This portrayal was marked by negative labels, a lack of social integration, support of government agendas, emphasis on resource strain, and a generally unfavourable media outlook. With the help of headlines, a prejudiced tone is set which impacts public viewpoints even before the readers fully engage with the content in the articles. Similar stigmatization is faced by Afghan refugees in other parts of the world as well. Despite isolated support for Afghan citizenship and integration, as previous studies highlighted, the media coverage remains more accusatory than neutral. This bias reflects an overreliance on government statements, which overshadow diverse perspectives and inhibit constructive discourse.

Social reflection and growth are limited due to the limited inclusion of dissenting voices and an abundance of representation for official narratives. The marginalization of the discussed demographic is exacerbated due to the framing of Afghan refugees as either victims, threats, or burdens, following the media coverage of major national events like the APS attack. This study highlights the need for a balanced, inclusive media approach that incorporates diverse perspectives to foster understanding and support for refugee populations. Such change would be crucial for promoting social cohesion, ethical journalism, and informed public discourse in Pakistan.

Recommendations

To improve inclusivity in Pakistan's media landscape, many institutions would have to restructure themselves by relevant government policies, which should be introduced or revised to provide a more fair avenue for representation. For that case, several strategic recommendations must be implemented, particularly concerning the representation of marginalized groups such as Afghan refugees. First and foremost, regulatory bodies like PEMRA should be restructured by the government for greater independence and transparency. This will facilitate public participation in decision-making processes, which can foster trust and mitigate biases in media coverage (Article 19, 2013). Strengthening protections for freedom of expression and aligning local media regulations with international standards will further safeguard media independence and reduce the risk of undue censorship.

To ensure that the media landscape is truly inclusive, there must be a concerted effort to amplify underrepresented voices. For Afghan refugees, this means encouraging media outlets to actively seek out and feature refugee perspectives. Partnerships between media organizations and refugee-led groups could provide journalists with direct access to the lived experiences of Afghan refugees, allowing for more accurate and nuanced reporting (Ghouri et al., 2022). Media training that emphasizes cultural sensitivity and ethical reporting practices is essential in this regard, helping journalists approach refugee narratives with empathy and respect.

Furthermore, media outlets should take active steps to address and challenge stereotypes or biases in their reporting. A more holistic portrayal of Afghan refugees—one that highlights their resilience, aspirations, and contributions to Pakistani society—should replace reductive or harmful depictions. This can be achieved through the implementation of diversity and inclusion policies within media organizations. These policies should guide editorial decisions, hiring

practices, and content production processes to ensure that minority voices are not marginalized but are instead actively represented in all media forms.

The government and regulatory bodies also have a critical role in fostering media accountability. By establishing clear ethical guidelines for reporting on refugees and other marginalized groups, they can incentivize media outlets to uphold their social responsibility to the public (Hussain et al., 2021). Additionally, supporting media literacy programs and providing ethical training for journalists will contribute to responsible and inclusive reporting across the board (Zulfiqar, 2022).

Lastly, adapting regulatory frameworks to address the challenges posed by digital media is crucial for creating a modernized and equitable media environment. With the rapid growth of digital platforms, these regulations should ensure that inclusivity and ethical standards are maintained across all media formats, from traditional outlets to online platforms. By prioritizing inclusivity, challenging biases, and promoting ethical reporting practices, the media can serve as a transformative force, amplifying the voices of marginalized groups like Afghan refugees and contributing to a more just and inclusive society.

References:

Afridi, M., Yousufi, M., & Khan, M. (2014). Military operation as a response to terrorism: A

    case study of Malakand division Pakistan. Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences.

    https://doi.org/10.5901/mjss.2014.v5n20p2000

Ahmed, Z. (2022). The Taliban's takeover of Afghanistan and Pakistan's non-traditional security

    challenges. Global Policy, 13(1), 125-131. https://doi.org/10.1111/1758-5899.13045

Ali, G. (2020). China–Pakistan cooperation on Afghanistan: Assessing key interests and

    implementing strategies. The Pacific Review, 35(3), 506-528.

    https://doi.org/10.1080/09512748.2020.1845228

Anjum, N., Malik, M., & Rabbi, F. (2019). Mistrust factor in Pak-Afghan fluctuating relations

    since beginning. Global Political Review, V(II), 46-55.

    https://doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2019(iv-ii).05

Andrew, B. C. (2007). Media-generated shortcuts: Do newspaper headlines present another. The

    Harvard International Journal of Press.

ARTICLE 19. (2013). *International standards: Regulation of the print media*. Retrieved from

    https://www.article19.org/resources/international-standards-regulation-print-media/

Baloch, A., Shah, S., Noor, Z., & Lacheheb, M. (2017). The economic effect of refugee crises on

    neighbouring host countries: Empirical evidence from Pakistan. International Migration,

    55(6), 90-106. https://doi.org/10.1111/imig.12389

Batool, S. (2019). Media representations and refugees crises: Framing of Afghan refugees in

    mainstream print media of Pakistan. Pakistan Social Sciences Review, 3(1), 461-473.

Bennett, J. R., Herman, E. S., & Chomsky, N. (1989). Manufacturing consent: the political

economy of the mass media. Contemporary Sociology a Journal of Reviews, 18(6), 937.

https://doi.org/10.2307/2074220

Boggs, R. (2012). Pakistan's Pashtun challenge: Moving from confrontation to integration.

Strategic Analysis, 36(2), 206-216. https://doi.org/10.1080/09700161.2012.646515

Country - Pakistan. (n.d.). Retrieved from Operational Data Portal:

https://data.unhcr.org/en/country/pak

DawnNews. (2023, October 3). 🔴LIVE | Caretaker Interior Minister Sarfaraz Bugti's news

Conference | Dawn News LiVE [Video]. YouTube.

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AdCTNP6qtGE

DAWN.COM. (2023, October 3). Govt sets deadline of Nov 1 for illegal immigrants to leave

Pakistan. DAWN.COM.

https://www.dawn.com/news/1779106/govt-sets-deadline-of-nov-1-for-illegal-immigrant

s-to-leave-pakistan

DAWN.COM. (2023b, December 8). Afghans residing legally to be deported if found involved

in political activities, says Bugti. DAWN.COM. https://www.dawn.com/news/1796239

Ehmer, E., & Kothari, A. (2021). Malaysia and the Rohingya: Media, migration, and politics.

Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies, 19(4), 378-392.

Fatima, M. J., & Torun, A. T. (2022). Representation of Rohingya refugees in the Bangladeshi

media: A content analysis. Rohingya Refugee Crisis in Myanmar: Ethnic Conflict and

Resolution, 261-289.

Fatima, M., Nosheen, F., Afzaal, M., Islam, F., Noreen, R., Imran, A., … & Ali, Y. (2023).
Nutritional and health status of Afghan refugee women living in Punjab: A
cross-sectional study. Food Science & Nutrition, 11(6), 2872-2882.
https://doi.org/10.1002/fsn3.3267

Gerritsen, A., Bramsen, I., Devillé, W., Willigen, L., Hovens, J., & Ploeg, H. (2006). Physical
and mental health of Afghan, Iranian and Somali asylum seekers and refugees living in
the Netherlands. Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology, 41(1), 18-26.
https://doi.org/10.1007/s00127-005-0003-5

Ghouri, S. J., David, A. H., & Hussain, M. S. (2022). Exploring Representation of the Christian
community on Electronic and Social Media in Pakistan: A Critical Discourse
Analysis. *Global Digital & Print Media Review, V(II)*, 80-91.
https://doi.org/10.31703/gdpmr.2022(V-II).08

Goffman, E. (1974). Frame Analysis An Essay on the Organization of Experience. Cambridge,
MA Harvard University Press. - References - Scientific Research Publishing. (n.d.).
https://www.scirp.org/reference/referencespapers?referenceid=1135076

Herman, E., & Chomsky, N. (2006). A propaganda model. Media and cultural studies:
Keyworks, 257-294.

Hussain, S., Shukkar, Q., & Shahzad, F. (2021). Social Responsibility of Media in Pakistan:
Exploring the Audience Perception. *Global Mass Communication Review, VI(I)*,
28-42. https://doi.org/10.31703/gmcr.2021(VI-I).03

Illegal foreign nationals to be deported after 1st Nov. (2023, October 3). Retrieved from Radio
Pakistan:

https://www.radio.gov.pk/03-10-2023/govt-sets-nov-1-deadline-for-deporting-all-illegal-foreign-nationals

Jan, A., Hassan, M., & Abbasi, I. (2021). Khyber Pakhtoonistan is a factor in Pak-Afghan relations: Challenges and way forward. Progressive Research Journal of Arts & Humanities (PRJAH), 2(1), 107-118. https://doi.org/10.51872/prjah.vol2.iss1.27

Jehangir, A. (2023). Finding peace journalism: An analysis of Pakistani media discourse on Afghan refugees and their forced repatriation from Pakistan. Media War & Conflict, 16(4), 582-598. https://doi.org/10.1177/17506352221149559

Kakar, A. (2020). Afghanistan towards independent transit trade: A decay of affiliation to Pakistan. Global Business Review, 24(3), 586-597. https://doi.org/10.1177/0972150920906993

Khan, H. (2020). China, the emerging economic power: Options and repercussions for Pak–US relations. International Politics. https://doi.org/10.1057/s41311-020-00265-1

Khan, Q., Akbar, S., & Inam, Z. B. (2022). Awarding of citizenship to Afghan and Bengali refugees: A comparative analysis of Pakistan's print and social media frames. Global Digital & Print Media Review, 1, 63-74.

Khan, S., & Anwar, N. (2021). Image schemas in diasporic visual discourse: Peripheral voices in the selected photographs of Afghan migrants living in Pakistan. Numl Journal of Critical Inquiry, 17(II). https://doi.org/10.52015/numljci.v17iii.172

Konnikova, M. (2014). How headlines change the way we think. The New Yorker, 17.

Mahmood, D. (2022). Afghan refugees: A threat to the economic security of Pakistan. Journal of Psychology and Political Science, (31), 16-23. https://doi.org/10.55529/jpps.31.16.23

Malik, M., Afzal, M., Farid, A., Mirza, B., & Waheed, M. (2019). Disease status of Afghan refugees and migrants in Pakistan. Frontiers in Public Health, 7. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpubh.2019.00185

Mukhtar, S., Fayaz, M., & Deeba, M. (2023). Afghan refugees in Pakistan and Syrian refugees in European Union: A comparative analysis. Journal of Economics Trade and Marketing Management, 5(1), p1. https://doi.org/10.22158/jetmm.v5n1p1

Naseer, A. (2021). From strategic partnership to strategic interdependence: The Pak-China duo. Pakistan Journal of International Affairs, 4(1). https://doi.org/10.52337/pjia.v4i1.35

Newton, K. (2006). May the weak force be with you: The power of the mass media in modern politics. European Journal of Political Research.

Norris, P. (2006). The role of the free press in promoting democratization, good governance and human development10. Matters, 45(4-6), 66.

Parkes, A. (2019). Pakistan's strategic culture and its Gordian knot in Afghanistan. Journal of Asian Security and International Affairs, 6(3), 254-274. https://doi.org/10.1177/2347797019885728

R., N. (2011). International forced migration and Pak-Afghan development concerns: Exploring Afghan refugee livelihood strategies. Journal of Social and Development Sciences, 2(4), 181-187. https://doi.org/10.22610/jsds.v2i4.667

Riffat Alam, Ruqiya Anwar, & Amrat Haq. (2022). Representing Afghan refugees in Pakistani press: Mapping out war or peace journalism. SHAJAR, 4(1), 34–43.

Saeedullah, A., Khan, M., Andrews, S., Iqbal, K., Ul‑Haq, Z., Qadir, S., … & Shahzad, M. (2021). Nutritional status of adolescent Afghan refugees living in Peshawar, Pakistan. Nutrients, 13(9), 3072. https://doi.org/10.3390/nu13093072

Shabir, G., Ali, S., & Iqbal, Z. (2011). US mass media and image of Afghanistan: Portrayal of Afghanistan by Newsweek and Time. South Asian Studies, 26(01), 83-101.

Shirazi, I. (2023, December 7). COAS says illegal foreigners 'seriously affecting' Pakistan's security and economy, backs deportation drive. *DAWN.COM*. https://www.dawn.com/news/1795795

Tehreek-e-Taliban. (n.d.). Retrieved from Counter Terrorism Guide: https://www.dni.gov/nctc/groups/ttp.html

Weng, E., & Mansouri, F. (2021). 'Swamped by Muslims' and facing an 'African gang' problem: Racialized and religious media representations in Australia. Continuum, 35(3), 468-486.

Zubair, M., Khan, M., & Shah, M. (2019). Analysis of Pakistan's policy towards Afghan refugees: A legal perspective. Global Political Review, IV(III), 28-38. https://doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2019(iv-iii).04

Zubair, M., Shahzad, S., & Khan, M. (2019). The position of Afghan refugees under various agreements and constitution of Pakistan: An analysis. Global Regional Review, IV(I), 462-472. https://doi.org/10.31703/grr.2019(iv-i).50

Zulfiqar, F. (Ed.). (2022). Evaluations of Regulatory Authorities, Government Packages, and

Policies. Pakistan Institution of Development Economics (PIDE).

Appendix A: URLs from Dawn Archive, Dated October 3rd 2023 to November 1st 2023

1. **Govt sets deadline of Nov 1 for illegal immigrants to leave Pakistan**, Oct 3rd, 2023. URL

2. **UN urges Pakistan to halt Afghan deportations**, Oct 28th, 2023. URL

3. **Govt initiates nationwide operation to deport illegal foreign nationals**, Nov 1st, 2023. URL

4. **Kabul calls Pakistan's decision to expel undocumented Afghan nationals 'unacceptable'**, Oct 4th, 2023. URL

5. **Concern over move to expel 'illegal' Afghans**, Oct 4th, 2023. URL

6. **Undocumented aliens given 28 days to leave**, Oct 4th, 2023. URL

7. **Ultimatum to illegal aliens poses historic dilemma**, Oct 5th, 2023. URL

8. **Over 0.3M illegal Afghans living in KP**, Oct 4th, 2023. URL

9. **90pc polio cases in Pakistan imported from Afghanistan: Health Minister**, Oct 5th, 2023. URL

10. **Afghan artists in Quetta protest against possible expulsion**, Oct 5th, 2023. URL

11. **30 Afghan families return home via Torkham border**, Oct 5th, 2023. URL

12. **Govt firm on repatriation plan amid criticism**, Oct 6th, 2023. URL

13. **Pockets of illegal Afghans identified in Sindh**, Oct 6th, 2023. URL

14. **51 Afghan nationals held in Sohrab Goth operation**, Oct 6th, 2023. URL

15. **13 undocumented Afghan families leave Swabi for their homeland**, Oct 7th, 2023. URL

16. **Pakistan must consider risks to returning Afghans, say UN agencies**, Oct 7th, 2023.

    URL

17. **1700 illegal Afghan nationals arrested in Karachi so far: Home Minister**, Oct 8th,

    2023. URL

18. **Turned Away**, Oct 8th, 2023. URL

19. **Return of unregistered Afghans gains momentum**, Oct 8th, 2023. URL

20. **UK rushes to move asylum-eligible Afghans from Pakistan**, Oct 9th, 2023. URL

21. **Two more Afghan settlements bulldozed in Islamabad**, Oct 10th, 2023. URL

22. **Illegal Afghans to be housed in Karachi, Sukkur for deportation**, Oct 11th, 2023.

    URL

23. **PHC orders govt to decide Afghan man's plea for citizenship**, Oct 12th, 2023. URL

24. **Nationalist parties mount pressure on Sindh govt for expulsion of illegal
    immigrants**, Oct 13th, 2023. URL

25. **SC stops expulsion of foreigner with expired Pakistan Origin Card**, Oct 14th, 2023.

    URL

26. **Pakistan urged not to deport Afghan US visa refugee applicants**, Oct 15th, 2023.

    URL

27. **Not just Afghans, all undocumented foreigners to be evicted: Minister**, Oct 16th,

    2023. URL

28. **1000 undocumented Afghans identified in Kohat**, Oct 17th, 2023. URL

29. **Plan to repatriate illegal aliens to stay unchanged, says FO**, Oct 18th, 2023. URL

30. **Sit-in at Chaman over new border rules**, Oct 19th, 2023. URL

31. **Govt adamant on mass deportation of illegal immigrants from Sindh**, Oct 20th, 2023.

    URL

32. **Chaman border protest escalates over passport-visa policy**, Oct 21st, 2023. URL

33. **FIA installs system at Torkham for visa verification**, Oct 22nd, 2023. URL

34. **Balochistan minister asks parties not to patronise illegal immigrants,** Oct 23rd, 2023.

    URL

    Only illegal Afghans to be deported, PHC told, Oct 24th, 2023. URL

    Discussion in Islamabad on Afghan refugees' issue abandoned after police raid, Oct

    25th, 2023. URL

35. **Plan in place to deport undocumented migrants in Rawalpindi division**, Oct 26th,

    2023. URL

36. **Chaman meeting discusses repatriation of undocumented immigrants**, Oct 27th,

    2023. URL

37. **With deadline looming, govt finalises plan for repatriation of illegal immigrants**, Oct

    28th, 2023. URL

38. **New, more powerful task force formed to probe passports for Afghans scandal**, Oct

    29th, 2023. URL

39. **Afghans return to Taliban rule as govt moves to expel 1.7M illegal residents with

    deadline tonight**, Oct 30th, 2023. URL

40. **HRCP fears Afghan deportations can trigger a humanitarian crisis**, Oct 31st, 2023.

    URL

41. **Politicians, rights activists move SC against deportation of Afghan refugees, asylum

    seekers**, Nov 1st, 2023. URL

42. **Govt initiates nationwide operation to deport illegal foreign nationals**, Nov 1st, 2023.

    URL

43. **Exodus underway as time almost up for illegal aliens**, Nov 2nd, 2023. URL